

Evaluation Program Ma'had Ali Using Evaluation Model of Countenance Stake

Fadil^{1*}, Zamroni², Sumarno³

¹Doctoral Program of Educational Research and Evaluation Department, Yogyakarta State University, Indonesia

²Program Pascasarjana, Yogyakarta State University, Indonesia,

³Program Pascasarjana, Yogyakarta State University, Indonesia,

ABSTRACT

This research aims to find out the comparison of evaluation result of intense and observation stage in all components of Ma'had Ali program. This research is conducted in di Ma'had Ali Al Hikmah 2 Sirampok Brebes, Central Java and Ma'had Ali Salafiyah Syafi'iyah Situbondo. Evaluation model used is countenance stake model. The components of Ma'had Ali program evaluated, including: antecedent, transaction, outcome. Research respondents include 101 students, 34 alumnus and 25 lecturers and Ma'had Ali staff program. The Data is collected by using questionnaire, interview and documentation as support data. The result finding show that the result of evaluation analysis of intense and observation stage obtained the result as follow: 1) there is a difference of evaluation result between intense and observation, both in antecedent, transaction and outcome phase in several indicators, 2) there is a congruence between intense and observation, only in several indicators that are not congruence, there are two indicators in antecedent, while in transaction and outcome phase there is only one indicator in each of them which is not congruent, 3) the relation of contingency among antecedent, transaction and outcome, there is a decreasing and increasing point, but in evaluation point of matrix is still categorized good.

Keywords

Evaluation result, Observation, Intense

Introduction

The development that is being carried out in Indonesia still requires sufficient human resources in terms of quantity and quality, education has a very important role in fulfilling the needs of these human resources. Article 3, Law No. 20 of 2003 on the National Education System, states that the function of national education is to develop skills and form dignified national character and civilization in order to educate the life of the nation. The purpose of national education is the need of potential development of learners to become human beings who believe and fear, have a noble character, healthy, knowledgeable, capable, creative, independent, and become democratic and responsible citizens.

In line with the objective of National Education, one of the educational institutions in Indonesia, especially in boarding school, appeared education program in the form of Islamic religious university that organize academic education in the field of mastery of Islamic religious sciences (tafaqquh fiddin) based on the yellow book, which is equipped with a study of modern sciences known as Ma'had Aly (Minister of Religious

Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, 2015) (Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 71 Year 2015 about Ma'had Aly).

Ma'had Aly is formally acknowledged as an early education institution at the higher education level refers to two previous government regulations, such as Law No. 20 of 2003 on the National Education System, in Article 30 paragraph (4) clearly states that Diniyah Education is a form of religious education. As well as Law No. 12 of 2012 on Higher Education. Article 30 paragraph (2) states that Ma'had Aly is a form of religious higher education.

The existence of Ma'had Aly began from a fact that the role and function of boarding school as a place to educate and foster people who are *rasikh fi al-dîn* began to create the change, especially understanding of *fiqh* is perceived to be fading. There are many religious study results in boarding school which are not so response to the latest religious problems.

The research results of the research and development agency and Training of the Ministry

of Religious Affairs about the Development of Education of Ma'had Aly (2018) stated that, institutionally most of Ma'had Aly is still looking for and formulating the format of education management, they do not have an adequate understanding of the standardization of higher education management, and almost all components of education have not met the educational standards as mandated in the regulation on Ma'had Aly standard. In terms of student input, academic quality that leads to the ability to study the yellow book is not used as a condition of entrance tests, but prefers quantity. Then, from the curriculum aspect in some Ma'had Aly, the percentage between courses in the field of specificity and courses in general is relatively balanced. In addition, the procurement of teaching staff having scientific capacity which is appropriate with the choice of study program, has not been fully implemented (the Research and Development Agency and Training of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, 2019).

Ma'had aly program in boarding school has a typical management that is different conceptually with modern education management, since Ma'had aly curriculum is independent and not standardized national curriculum, learning model with wetonan and bahsul masail method, limited human resources and infrastructure and the evaluation system is limited in formative and summative evaluation system (Fadli, 2017).

In the preliminary study that the author conducted in Ma'had Aly Islamic Boarding School Salafiyah Syafi'iyah Situbondo, and Ma'had Aly Al Hikmah 2 Sirampog, Brebes, Central Java, there are interesting things that the author found. At Ma'had Aly Al hikmah 2 Sirampog, the teaching and learning process is carried out with "lesehan" concept which is completed with lecturer chair and lecturer desk, as well as student tables, with a maximum lecture hall capacity of 25 people, with sufficient ventilation, therefore it can support face-to-face lecture activities. While in Ma'had Aly Islamic Boarding School of Salafiyah Syafi'iyah Situbondo, the learning process use the desk chair lecturer (Mursyid) and students, air-conditioned classrooms, lecture activities as well as already using LCD projectors, has a library which is supported with e-students application.

Ma'had Aly has the similarity that is between the Manager and administrative personnel are in one office, students are not allowed to carry a mobile phone, and the internet network is very limited. However, based on the results of interviews with some students have an extraordinary passion to learn the field of mastery of Islamic science (tafaqquh fi ad-din) based on the yellow book.

Ma'had Aly program is an Islamic religious college that organizes academic education in the field of mastery of Islamic religious science (tafaqquh fi ad-din) based on the yellow book that can only be established and organized by Islamic boarding school. Therefore, Ma'had Aly curriculum should be able to encourage students to understand and live the yellow book in depth, so that they can produce the graduates having qualifications and competencies as scholars that is able to carry out the functions of community development counselling, nudity, education, and religious fatwas to answer the challenges of the future era (Minister of Religious Affairs, 2015).

Based on the problem, it is necessary to evaluate the Ma'had Aly program in boarding school, due to through the evaluation will be obtained information about the effectiveness of the program so it is able to optimize the results, quality and efficiency of the program (Spiel et al., 2015). The results of this evaluation will also be able to contribute the idea to make Ma'had Aly as an effective program which is be able to produce scholars. So that, it can be one of the studies that can give suggestion to boarding school which is opened ma'had Aly program.

This research will focus on the evaluation of input system, process, and program output. Taking consideration of the specific nature of the problem examined, Ma'had Aly program requires proper evaluation studies to know the effectiveness of the program. The author chose The Countenance Stake Model Evaluation, because this Stake model emphasizes the similarity between what is desired (Intention) and what really happens (observation) (Fatima et al., 2016).

Method

This research is an evaluation research using quantitative and qualitative descriptive approach, by describing the characteristics and explaining the phenomenon of Ma'had Aly Program. This research was conducted in 2 large Boarding Schools in Central Java and East Java, such as: 1) Al Hikmah Boarding School 2 Sirampog Brebes Central Java, and 2) Islamic Boarding School Salafiyah Syafi'iyah Asembagus Situbondo East Java. The evaluation model used is the countenance stake model. Components of Ma'had Aly program that will be evaluated are: Input (antecedent), Process (transaction), outcome. The respondents of the study included 101 students, 34 alumni and 25 lecturers and program managers of Ma'had Ali. Data is collected by using questionnaires, interviews and documentation as supporting data. Instrument validation using the validity of the content and construct, with the help of expert judgment that includes four experts in the field of evaluation, measurement and religion, then analysed by using Aiken's formula with the validation results 0.92. The estimated reliability of the instrument using alpha's Cronbach formula resulted in 0.947.

Result and Discussion

The evaluation result by using combination evaluation of stake countenance model and

Table 1. Descriptive Statistical Component of Input (Antecedent)

	N	Range	Minimum	Maximum	Sum	Mean	Std. Deviation	Variance
Antecedent (INPUT)	101	3.00	2,00	5,00	374	3,70	.558	.311
Valid N (listwise)	101							

Descriptive statistics result obtained a minimum value which is 2.00, a maximum value is 5.00, a total is 374, an average value is 3.70, a standard deviation value is 0.558 and a variant value is 0.311. From the descriptive result data described at an average value of 3.70, it is concluded that the overall distribution of data on input components can be said to be high.

Based on the result of scale sharing from the conversion table, the data obtained, will then be searched for evaluation result of input

Kirkpatrick Four Levels Evaluation Model toward Ma'had Aly program is conducted on intense and observation of Ma'had Aly program.

Evaluation Result of Intense (Expected)

Overall evaluation result of input component (antecedent)

The evaluation of the intense stage toward the Input (Antecedent) component is focused on three things, such as:

- 1) Academic Ability,
- 2) Mental, Physical and Tool Readiness
- 3) Condition of infrastructure.

The evaluation was conducted by using a questionnaire on 101 respondents, including students enrolled in Ma'had Aly on Marhalah Ula. Data evaluation result with the criteria: 1. Very less, 2. Less, 3. Enough, 4. Good, and 5. Very good. The data is then analysed using descriptive statistics with the help of SPSS program software. The result of descriptive statistical analysis of Input (Antecedent) components will be described into the overall result described in Table 1 as follows:

(Antecedent) component that can be categorized into five categories, such as: very good, good, enough, less, and very less. Frequency distribution on Antecedent component based on descriptive statistical results can describe the evaluation results of the five scales. The result of frequency distribution dependency is presented on table 2 below:

Table 2. Evaluation Result of Intens on the Input Component (antecedents)

		Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Less	1	1.0	1.0
	Enough	32	31.7	32.7
	Good	64	63.4	96.0
	Very good	4	4.0	100.0
	Total	101	100.0	

Based on table 2, in can be observed that the frequency of tendency of evaluation result on intense stage toward input component (Antecedent). Analysis result show that there are 4 respondents or there are 4.0 percent respondents are in very good category, then there are 64 respondents (63.04 percent) that are in good category. Meanwhile, 32 respondents (31.07 percent) are in enough category. Based on the result, it can be concluded that the tendency of intense evaluation result in input component (Antecedent) is in good category. It can be noticed from the frequency that answer with very good and good category is only 73.4 percent. The evaluation result toward input component show that Ma'had Aly has not had good input yet.

Evaluation Result of the overall Process Component

The focus of the evaluation of the process component in intense stage is on the expected implementation of Ma'had Aly program in Boarding school. The instruments used are questionnaires for program managers and students, the number of respondents is 66, with 12 question items. process the component of process that concern to be evaluated are: 1) Management of Ma'had Aly program management, 2) lecture process in Ma'had Aly program, 3) professionalism Mursyid. These three indicators are determinants of whether the program process is good or not. Data answer evaluation result by using criteria: 1. Very less, 2. Less, 3. Enough, 4. Good, and 5. Very good. The results of data analysis are as follows:

Table 3. The Result of Intense Evaluation in Process Component (transactions)

		Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Very less	0	0	0
	Less	1	1.5	1.5
	Enough	10	15.2	16.7
	Good	52	78.8	95.5
	Very good	3	4.5	100.0
	Total	66	100.0	100.0

Based on Table 3, it can be notice that the frequency of the tendency in intense stage evaluation result on process components. The analysis result show that there are 3 respondents (4.5 percent) that are in very good category, 52 respondents (78.08 percent) are in the good category, 10 respondents (15.2 percent) are in enough category, 1 respondent (1.5 percent) is in less category, while answering the category is very less or 0 respondent. Based on these results, it can be concluded that the result of intense evaluation on the process component is in good category. This case can be noticed from the frequency of answering with excellent and good categories is only 83.3 percent. The evaluation result of the process component in Intense stage showed that Ma'had Aly is expected to carry out the process well.

Overall Evaluation Result of Result Component (Outcome)

Evaluation of the components of the Intense output stage in this research use questionnaire instruments and interviews of program managers and students that are in the final semester at Marhalah Ula and Marhalah Tsani as respondents. The focus of evaluation is on three main indicators on the components of output, including: 1) academic skill in the field of fiqh, interpretation, hadith and tool science, 2) skill in the field of methodology Al-istinbath, 3) academic skill in society, the number of respondents is 110. Data answer evaluation results using the criteria: 1. Very less, 2. Less, 3. Enough, 4. Good, and 5. Very good. The results of data analysis are as

follows:

Table 4. The Evaluation Result of Intens in Output Component (Outcome)

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Enough	23	20.9	20.9	20.9
Good	80	72.7	72.7	93.6
Very good	7	6.4	6.4	100.0
Total	110	100.0	100.0	

Based on Table 4, it can be noticed that the frequency of tendency of intense stage evaluation result on output components. The analysis result show that 7 respondents (6.4 percent) are in very good category, 80 respondents (72.7 percent) are in the good category, 23 respondents (20.9 percent) are in enough category, while the respondent answering in less and very less category is 0 respondent. Based on these results, it can be concluded that the result of intense evaluation on the output component are in good category. It can be observed from the frequency of answering with excellent and good categories which is only 79.1 percent. While the answer in enough category is only 20.9 percent.

Evaluation Result of Observation Stage

Evaluation Result of Input

Evaluation of Ma'had Aly input program in boarding school environment is done to describe the how far Ma'had Aly Program in boarding school environment has good input to implement Ma'had Aly Program. Evaluation of input component in this research use questionnaire instruments and interviews given to students who became respondents involving 101 students who directly adapted to the Ma'had Aly Program. There are three main points concern to be evaluated in Ma'had Aly Program in boarding school environment, such as: 1) academic skill, 2) mental, physical, and tool readiness, 3) Students Perception about infrastructure condition. Data answer evaluation results using criteria: 1. Very less, 2. Less, 3. Enough, 4. Good, and 5. Very good. The data analysis results are as follows:

Table 5. Evaluation Result of Observation Stage in Input Component (antecedents)

		Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Very less	1	1.0	1.0
	Less	12	11.9	12.9
	Enough	58	57.4	70.3
	Good	30	29.7	100.0
	Very good	0	0	0
	Total	101	100.0	

Based on Table 5, it can be noticed that the frequency of observation evaluation result of input component. The analysis result show that 0 respondents (0.0 percent) is in very good category, 30 respondents (29.7 percent) are in good category, 58 respondents (57.4 percent) are in enough category, 12 respondents (11.9 percent) are in less category, while answering in very less category is 1 respondent (1.0 percent). Based on these results, it can be concluded that the tendency of observation evaluation result in input component are in enough category. The frequency of the respondent answering in good category are 87.1 percent, the respondents answering in very good category is 0, the number of respondents answering in less and very less category is 12.9 percent. The evaluation of the input component indicates that Ma'had Aly has good input.

Evaluation Result of The Process Component

Evaluation toward the process component is to describe the extent of the Ma'had Aly Program in boarding school environment has been well implemented by the object or subject of the program. Evaluation of process components in this research use questionnaire and interview instruments. There are three main indicators of process components concern to be evaluated in Ma'had Aly Program in boarding school environment, including: 1) management of Ma'had Aly program management, 2) lecture process in Ma'had Aly program, 3) professionalism of Mursyid who teaches Ma'had Aly program. The three indicators of the process components as determinants whether the process component of Ma'had Aly Program is good or not in the boarding school environment.

The overall evaluation will show the total quality of Ma'had Aly program in the boarding school

environment by combining all indicators of input component results. The evaluation involved 83 students as respondents. The data were analysed using descriptive statistics with the help of SPSS 16 software. Data answer evaluation result use the criteria: 1. Very less, 2. Less, 3. Enough, 4. Good, and 5. Very good. The data analysis results are as follows:

Table 6. Evaluation Result of Observation

Stage in Process Component (transactions)

	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Very less	1	1.2	1.2
Less	7	8.4	9.6
Enough	26	31.3	41.0
Good	41	49.4	90.4
Very good	8	9.6	100.0
Total	83	100.0	

Based on Table 6, it can be noticed that the tendency frequency of the evaluation result of the Observation stage on the Process component. The result of the analysis show that 8 respondents (9.6 percent) are in very good category, 41 respondents (49.4 percent) are in good category, 26 respondents (31.3 percent) are in enough category, 7 respondents (8.4 percent) are in less category, while the respondents answering in very less category consist of 1 respondent (1.2 percent). Based on these results, it can be concluded that the results of observation evaluation in the process component are in enough category. It can be noticed from the frequency that the number of respondents answering with good and enough category is 80.7 percent. Meanwhile, the number respondents answering with very well category is 9.6 percent. While, the number of respondents answering with less and very less category is 9.6 percent. The results of the evaluation of the process components show that Ma'had Aly in not carrying out the process properly.

Evaluation Result of Output Component (outcome)

Evaluation toward outcome component of Ma'had Aly program in boarding school environment is done to describe how far Ma'had Aly Program in boarding school environment has produced a good output which is appropriate with the purpose of the existence of Ma'had Aly program. Evaluation

of the outcome component in this research use questionnaire instruments and interviews where the alumni are as respondents. There are three main indicators on the output component concerning to be evaluated in Ma'had Aly Program in boarding school environment, including: 1) academic skill in the field of Fiqih, interpretation, hadith and tool science, 2) skill in the field of methodology Al-istinbath, 3) academic skill in society. The three indicators of the output component as a determinant whether Ma'had Aly Program is success or not which is held in boarding school.

The overall evaluation will show the total quality of outcome of Ma'had Aly program in Boarding school environment by combining all indicators result of output component. The evaluation involves 34 alumni as the respondents that are directly implement Ma'had Aly program. Analysis data use descriptive statistic with the help of SPSS 16 software. The answering data of evaluation result use the criteria: 1. Very less, 2. Less, 3. Enough, 4. Good, 5. Very good. The data analysis result is presented on the table below.

Table 7. Evaluation Result of Observation

Stage in Output Component

	Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid Less	1	2.9	2.9	2.9
Enough	20	58.8	58.8	61.8
Good	12	35.3	35.3	97.1
Very good	1	2.9	2.9	100.0
Total	34	100.0	100.0	

Based on Table 7, it can be noticed that the frequency of tendency of the evaluation results of the Observation stage on the outcome component. The results of the analysis show that 1 respondent (2.9 percent) is in very good category, 12 respondents (35.3 percent) are in good category, 20 respondents (58.8 percent) are in enough category, 1 respondent (2.9 percent) is in less category, while the respondents answering in very less category is 0 respondent (0.0 percent). Based on these results, it can be concluded that the results of observation evaluation on the output component in enough category. It can be noticed from the frequency that the number of respondents

answering with good and enough category is 92.11 percent. While the number of respondents answering in very good category is only 2.9 percent. While the number of respondents answering in less and very less category is 2.9 percent. The evaluation of the outcome component shows that Ma'had Aly have not had a good outcome yet.

The Comparison of Evaluation Result of Intense and Observation

The research data result the category as follow:

Table 8. Categorization

Range	Criteria
>3.25	Very good
2.5 – 3.25	Good
1,75 – 2,5	Enough
<1,75	Less

The basis of the evaluation that the author uses is the Countenance Stake model which is the suitability between the expected (Intense) and the implementation (Observation), so that the data of this evaluation will present two types of evaluation data both at the Intense and Observation stages. The data of the overall evaluation of antecedent, transaction, and outcome both at the Intense stage and observation data we present in table 9 below:

Table 9. Suitability Data Between Intense and Observation

Stage	Indicator	Intense		Observation	
		Score	Criteria	Score	Criteria
Antecedent	Academic skill	3,7	Very good	2,9	Good
	Mental, physic and tool readiness	3,8	Very good	3,5	Very good
	facilities and infrastructure condition	3,9	Very good	3,2	Good
	Average of Antecedent	3,8	Very good	3,2	Good
Total of Antecedent		11,4		9,6	
Transaction	Management Program	3,8	Very good	3,4	Very good
	Lecture process	3,6	Very good	3,7	Very good
	Professionalism Mursyid	3,6	Very good	3,3	Very good

Average of Transaction		3,67	Very good	3,47	Very good
Total of Transaction		11		10,4	
Outcome	Skill in the field of Fiqh, Tafsir, hadist and Ilmu Alat	3,5	Very good	3,45	Very good
	Skill of Istimbath	3,6	Very good	3,0	Very good
	Practicing Science in society	2,9	Good	3,5	Very good
Average of Outcome		3,33		3,32	
Total of Outcome					

Based on the data stated in Table 9, it is obtained several assessment descriptions as follows:

A. Obtained data at the antecedent stage on the following 3 indicators:

- Academic skill at the intention stage is 3.7 with excellent criteria, while at observation is 2.9 with excellent criteria..
- Mental, Physical and Tool Readiness at the intention stage is 3.8 while at observation is 3.5.
- Condition of infrastructure at the intention stage is 3.9 while on observation is 3.2.

B. Obtained data at the Transaction stage on 3 indicators as follows:

- Program Management, at the intention stage is 3.8 while on observation is 3.4
- Lecture Process, at the intention stage is 3.6 while at observation stage is 3.7
- Professionalism Mursyid, at the stage of intention is 3.6 while on observation stage is 3.32

C. Obtained data at the Output stage in 3 indicators as follows:

- Skill in the field of Fiqh, Tafsir, Hadith and Tool Science. At the intention stage is 3.5 while on observation stage is 3.45
- Istimbath skill, at the intention stage is 3.6 while at observation stage is 3.0

- Practicing Science in the community, at the stage of intention is 2.6 while on observation stage is 3.5.

Based on the results of the evaluation, there is a discrepancy between the expected (Intense) and the observation. At the antecedent stage on all indicators: it has criteria "excellent" on intense, and "Good" on observation. Based on the data, there is a real discrepancy between the intention and observation, especially in the Indicators of academic excellence, this happens since the entrance selection system in the Ma'had Aly Program is not only concerned with academic skill, but also the interest factor is a basic consideration. In addition to the indicators of mental and physical readiness, in general mental and physical readiness both at the Intense stage and observation there is no difference, there is little difference that lies in the readiness of the tool when they go to college, because there are some obstacles, especially in terms of dissipation.

At the Transaction stage, the "Program Management" indicator has "excellent" criteria on intense, and "Good" on observation. This happens because at this stage there are several activities beyond the control of Ma'had Aly Program management, but should be followed by all components of Islamic boarding school including Ma'had Aly. Meanwhile, on the indicators "Lecture Process" and "Professionalism Mursyid" have criteria "excellent" in intense, as well as on observation. At the output stage, in the indicator "skill in the field of fiqh, interpretation, hadith, and tool science in Intense and observation both have "excellent" criteria, while in the indicator "skill of Istimbath" in Intense criteria is "very good" in observation criteria is "good". While on the indicator "practicing science in society" in Intense has the criteria "good" and on observation is "excellent".

Conclusion

Based on the research result, it is concluded that the overall evaluation input component is in not good category, while in indicators, indicator of academic skill is in not good category, indicator of mental, physical and tool readiness are in not good category, and indicator of infrastructure is in not good category. The overall evaluation component

process is in a good category while the indicators: Ma'had Aly program management is in the good category, the lecture process in Ma'had Aly program is in the good category, Mursyid professionalism that teaches Ma'had Aly program is also in the good category. The overall evaluation of outcome component is in not good category, while the indicator of academic skill in the field of Fiqh, Tafsir, Hadith, and tool science are in good category, indicator of academic skill in the field of Al-Istinbath is in not good category, indicator of academic skill in the field of society is in not good category.

References

- [1] Badan Litbagng dan Diklat Kementerian Agama RI. (2019). *Pengembangan Pendidikan Ma'had Aly*. 26 Juni.
- [2] Direktur Pendidikan Keagamaan & Pondok Pesantren. (2004). *Petunjuk Pelaksanaan Pengembangan Pondok Pesantren Ma'had Aly*. In *Dialog*. <https://doi.org/10.47655/dialog.v42i1.325>
- [3] Fadli, H. (2017). MANAJEMEN PENDIDIKAN MA'HAD ALY (Studi Kasus Di Ma'had Aly Darul Hikmah Pondok Pesantren Nurul Hakim Kediri Lombok Barat NTB). *EL-HIKAM: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Kajian Keislaman, Volume X*,.
- [4] Menteri Agama RI. (2015). *PMA 71 2015 Tentang Ma'had Aly*.
- [5] Spiel, C., Schober, B., & Bergsmann, E. (2015). Program Evaluation. In *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences: Second Edition* (Second Edi, Vol. 19, Issue 1). Elsevier. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-097086-8.22015-1>
- [6] Direktur Pendidikan Keagamaan & Pondok Pesantren. (2004). *Petunjuk Pelaksanaan Pengembangan Pondok Pesantren Ma'had Aly*. In *Dialog*. <https://doi.org/10.47655/dialog.v42i1.325>
- [7] Indonesia, P. R. (2007). Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor:55 Tahun 2007 Tentang: Pendidikan Agama dan Pendidikan Keagamaan. *Arsip Negara Republik Indonesia*.
- [8] kemenag.go.id. (2017). *Lagi, Kemenag*

Terbitkan SK 14 Ma'had Aly.

<https://kemenag.go.id/berita/read/505094>

[9] Menteri Agama RI. (2015). *PMA 71 2015 Tentang Ma'had Aly.*

[10] *Peraturan Menteri Agama Republik Indonesia Nomor 33 Tahun 2016 Tentang Gelar Akademik Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan.* (2016).