

The Effectiveness Of Using The Historical Story In The Achievement And Critical Thinking For Intermediate Stage Students In In Social Studies For The Second Intermediate Grade

Assistant.Prof. Dr. AbdMuhammed Ghaidan Al-Dulaimi

The Republic of Iraq Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research

University Of Anbar College of Education for Human Sciences

Abstract:

The current research aims to identify the effectiveness of the historical story in the achievement and critical thinking of middle school students in social studies for the second intermediate grade. In order to achieve the objectives of the research, the sample was chosen. The sample consisted of Al-Ramadi, which is (IbnZaidoun Intermediate School for Boys), the number of students in the school for the second intermediate grade is (64) students. They are divided into two divisions (32) students in the experimental division (A) and (32) students in the control division (B), Equivalence was conducted between the two research groups in (previous information, intelligence test, chronological age calculated in months for students, academic achievement of parents, scores of the before critical thinking test). The study topics that will be studied during the trial period were identified and behavioral objectives were formulated from the topics from the three chapters (third, fourth and fifth) of the social book scheduled for the academic year 2018-2019 in the second semester. The formulated behavioral objectives reached (119) behavioral objectives. Two tests were prepared, one of which measures achievement, a component of (40) objective items (multiple choice), The other measures the achievement of critical thinking, consisting of (20) paragraphs. The paragraphs were distributed on the critical thinking skills to the five, and each skill consisted of 4 positions, and each position consisted of three answers. The researcher used statistical methods and using the Excel 2010 program, and the results showed the superiority of the abstract group over the control group in the achievement and critical thinking tests at the level of 0.05 in favor of the experimental group.

- **Keywords:** (story, achievement, critical thinking, history).

Research problem :

The researcher found, after interviews with a group of teachers of social sciences (history), that most of the history teachers use traditional methods and methods in their teaching. In this way, they assure students of the truth of what they imagine that the subject of history is a difficult and dry

subject. Most of their interest is in teaching students about events, names and dates, as well as the lack of interest in methods and methods that develop thinking skills, especially critical thinking. (Hamid and Muhammad, 8: 2019).

Students often feel the difficulty of history as a study subject, due to the nature of the historical subject itself, and its related spatial and temporal dimensions. On the other hand, it is due to the methods of its teaching, which take the form of Preservation, Indoctrination and memorization.

When accompanying students on school visits in the application subject, the researcher noted that few teachers use an interesting narrative style that provokes motivation to study and provokes critical thinking. Therefore, the research problem is formulated in the following question: **What is the effectiveness of using the historical story in the achievement and critical thinking for intermediate stage students in in social studies for the second intermediate grade?**

Research importance:

- 1- The research may address a problem that most social studiesteachers face. It is the knowledge of the potential and impact of the different ways of presenting knowledge, so that the student can acquire and apply it in other situations.
- 2- This research may direct the attention of teachers in general and teachers of social sciences in particular to the need to diversify teaching strategies and pay attention to teaching students how to think critically.
- 3- The results of the research may lead to presenting a method of teaching for male and female teachers in our schools, which increases the efficiency of the educational process in general, and improves the

students' acquisition of knowledge in the subject of social studies.

- 4- This study may provide a method or style that provokes fun and provokes critical thinking, to be discussed and used in teaching through training courses held by the general directorates in the governorates.

Research objectives:

- ❖ The research objectives to achieve the following:
 - 1- Recognizing the effect of the effectiveness of the historical story on the achievement of second-grade intermediate students in the subject of social studies (Chapter Two, History).
 - 2- Recognizing the effect of the effectiveness of the historical story on the critical thinking of second-grade intermediate students in the subject of social studies (Chapter Two, History).

Research hypotheses:

- 1- There is no statistically significant difference at the level (0.05) between the average scores of students who study using the story and those who study in the usual way.
- 2- There is no statistically significant difference at the level (0.05) between the average degrees of critical thinking among students who study using the story and those who study in the usual way.

Research limits :

The current research is determined by the following: A sample of school students (IbnZaydoun Intermediate School for Boys) in the city of Ramadi, Anbar

Governorate, morning schools for the academic year 2018-2019. In the subject of social studies (Chapter Two, History, fourth, fifth and sixth classes) for the second intermediate grade.

Define terminology:

First: Effectiveness: The amount of desired change in the experimental study caused by the independent variables in the dependent variables on which the experimental research design is based (Khammas, 2018: p. 336).

Procedural definition: The size of the change in achievement for second-grade female students in the social subject is average, after teaching by the story method in the period of application of the experiment, and it is measured statistically by the effect coefficient (ETA square μ^2), between the mean scores of the experimental and control groups.

Second: Story method: An educational approach that directly affects the students by moving their emotions and arousing their conscience, and thus they interact with the content of the story, as if they are one of its heroes, representing the positive trends, and repelling its bad, corrupt values (Al-Hashimi and others, 2014: 216).

Third: Critical thinking: Examiner thinking about the minutes of the topic based on criteria characterized by absolute objectivity and impartiality, in order to take an objective and comprehensive decision on the specific topic.

Procedural definition: It is an attempt to test the opinions presented in the light of the stories presented to the students of the

second intermediate grade when teaching social studies (Chapter Two History), and it includes five skills: deduction, defining postulates and assumptions, deduction, interpretation, and evaluating arguments.

Fourth: Achievement: The level of education achieved after going through educational experiences in a certain period and measured by written or performance tests (Sahin, and others, 2018: p.2).

Procedural Definition: The knowledge that students of the second intermediate grade acquire from teaching social studies (Chapter Two History) in the second course, and it is measured by the degree they obtain in the test prepared for research purposes.

Fourth: Social Studies: The subjects that study the human being in his relations and interaction with others, his relations with the environment and society, human issues, problems, events and attitudes, and is considered a link between all the natural and human sciences, as they are linked to each other to establish the relationships that developed between members of society (Alwan, 2016: p. 531).

Procedural definition: The sociology curriculum for second-grade intermediate students, which contains geographical and historical knowledge about the Arab world, with the aim of acquiring civic values, skills, and trends that aim to inculcate concepts of good citizenship by organizing the content of the social book in the form of an integrated and interconnected knowledge matrix.

Second grade intermediate: The second grade of the intermediate school with three

years, in which students are accepted after passing the first grade.

Theoretical framework and previous studies

First: The method of the story:

The story is one of the arts that influence the value behavior of students and readers in everyday situations. It is also more lively and diagnosing live situations and more attractive to students and its ability to convince them, as it provokes their feelings, possesses their minds, develops the ability to innovate in them, and often flies them in an atmosphere of imagination far from reality (Ali, 2017: 141).

A-The story and its relationship to academic achievement:

The story is constantly receiving increasing attention from teachers and students, as it is considered one of the arts that influence the behavior of students, as it achieves more for him than any other literary color achieves for him. Its characters, so it develops creativity in them, and flies them in imagination, thus expanding their perceptions. It is also an intellectual process that develops students' academic achievement and expands the horizons of thinking and imagination. In addition the story provides students with great information and knowledge, develops his linguistic wealth and increases his ability to express through paraphrasing and narrating what he heard in the story. Interest in the story and its style in developing academic achievement, values and positive trends. The story is not limited to raising the young. Rather, they often have a greater

impact on adults, especially teenagers who are in the middle school stage. The story fits the stage of adolescence and develops their social personality and prepares them to become active in their societies (Al-Hashemi and others, 2014: 54).

The story is one of the arts that influence the value behavior of students and readers in everyday situations. It is also more lively and diagnosing live situations and more attractive to students and its ability to persuade them, as it provokes their feelings, possesses their minds, develops the ability to innovate in them, and often flies them in an atmosphere of imagination away from reality. In the study (Kruse, 2010) five stories at a high scientific level in a group study. From students from the preparatory stage and research on the impact of short historical stories in teaching biology, the content included scientific stories, ideas about the age of the Earth, biological evolution, and genetics, and given the results reached after the end of the experiment, it was noticed that the students' attention to the presented scientific content increased, and their interest and enjoyment of stories and scientific content increased at the same time. Their academic achievement increased and they had positive attitudes towards the subject matter, and as a result, the students understood the nature of the scientific content presented through stories. The researcher drew attention to the fact that the students' understanding and results were related to the extent of understanding the storytelling and in general. The method of historical stories succeeded in teaching science and improving their creative and experimental aspects (Kruse, 2010: 55-56).

Historical stories: These stories are based on historical events, war sites, invasions and characters. It aims to develop children's sense of belonging and patriotism. The writer of the historical story usually searches for the environment of the story in the history books, so he picks up descriptions of the clothes and customs of the people in that era and uses them. And leave the final artistic touches to his imagination. The storyteller must begin with a preface, the purpose of which is to arouse the child's attention and suspense him to follow it. When the story is presented, the weapon with which the warrior fought, his clothing, what kind of mounts he rode, and how he prayed and toured, and historical stories play a major role in national belonging and developing national awareness. Therefore, students prefer stories related to life experiences experienced by the heroes of history (Jayusi, Al-Jamal, 2019: 108).

Second: The concept of critical thinking:

The interest in developing critical thinking abilities in educational circles is not new, and its roots can be traced back to Plato's Academy. Some believe that the roots of critical thinking are deep in the ancient world and can be traced back mainly to the teaching practices of the philosopher Socrates (2500) years ago, who discovered a method for putting together a series of questions that render his interlocutors unable to justify their logical confidence in what they know and shake their confidence in themselves. He also called for an examination of ideas and hypotheses and analysis. This method is now called (Socrates' approach to questioning), which represents a strategy for critical thinking in

teaching. Socrates laid out a work schedule for critical thinking called (reflective skepticism) on familiar beliefs, sorting out logical and reasonable evidence from those that are consistent with our self-interests.

The concern of critical thinking: examining and evaluating the solutions offered, which is: "Reasonable reflective thinking that focuses on making a decision about what he thinks or is doing, or is the process of using logical reasoning rules and avoiding common fraternity in judgment. Critical thinking aims to reach the truth after denying doubt about it. By studying and examining the logical evidence and the available evidence (Abdul-Azim and Mahmoud, 2015: 26).

The concept of critical thinking refers to the multifaceted process that includes knowledge, skill, and attitude that interact with each other to form this type of thinking. And knowledge in this field includes the student's knowledge of the sources of information related to the field he deals with, since critical thinking does not happen out of nothing. Knowledge includes: experience, knowledge of the opinions of others, and the study material, which constitutes an important aspect of the ability to think critically. Critical thinking is one of the important and vital topics that education has been preoccupied with in the past and present. This is because of its great importance in empowering students with basic skills in the learning process, as the important aspects are reflected in the tendency of educators of different scientific positions to adopt strategies for teaching and learning critical thinking skills, such as the story strategy.

Contemporary education's interest in critical thinking does not exceed two decades, as the impact of the behavioral school on American education contributed to neglecting interest in the development of thinking until the seventies of the last century. It is known that the behavioral school denies the existence of mental processes or the possibility of subjecting them to research and study. With the shift of educators, starting in the seventies, to the cognitive school that affirms that the learner must be an active information processor, interest in developing thinking in general and critical thinking in particular appeared (Younis and Jassim, 2017: 9-10).

Critical thinking skills :

First: Elicitation (sometimes called analogy):It is the thinking that draws a conclusion from two or more premises, and there is a relationship between these premises and the result.

Second: Conclusion:It is the ability through which certain conclusions can be drawn, based on facts and data.

Third: Explanation:The intellectual process by which the student judges whether the proposed explanations logically derive from the information provided or not, assuming that the information is correct.

Fourth: Evaluating the arguments:The mental process by which an individual distinguishes between strong and weak arguments based on their importance and relevance to the topic presented.

Fifth: Knowing the assumptions or postulates:It is a thing or a result that is

accepted in light of certain facts or premises (Younis and Jassim, 2017: 132-133).

Previous studies:

1- A study (Hamdan, 2018) The study was conducted in Jordan.

The study aimed to investigate the effect of the storyboard on raising achievement in Arabic language for second grade students. The study sample consisted of (100) second-grade students, who were deliberately chosen from two schools and distributed equally (50 male and female students in each group) into two experimental and control groups. An achievement test was developed, validity and reliability were conducted for it, and appropriate statistical analyzes were conducted. The results of the study indicated that there were statistically significant differences at the level (0.05) between the two groups and in favor of the experimental group, and there were no statistically significant differences in the performance of students according to the gender variable.

2- A study (Al-Muzaffar, 2017) conducted in Iraq.

The study aimed to identify the role of the short story (expressive stories) in teaching art education and its impact on the achievement of first intermediate grade students. The one-group experimental approach was used, and the study sample consisted of (30) students. The study reached the following results: There is a statistically significant difference at the level (0.05) in the post test by developing the imagination of middle school students through their artistic expression with the

effect of the story, and in favor of the experimental group, The statistical results of the hypothesis showed that there was a difference between the average achievement of the experimental group students between the pre and post tests and in favor of the post application.

3- A study (Mahmood, 2017) The study was conducted in Pakistan.

This study investigates the effectiveness of an instructional design for developing critical thinking skills in an Initial Teacher Education (ITE) institution in Pakistan. The study implemented a multi-method sequential explanatory approach followed by a quantitative investigation phase, followed by a qualitative investigation phase. The Educational Psychology Unit CT Skills intervention is designed to be taught in a master's education programmer. The study sample consisted of 60 students divided into two groups: an experimental group that included (30) students who learned using the instructional design, and a control group of (30) students who were taught using the usual method. The critical thinking test was used to measure the degree to which critical thinking skills were improved. The intervention lasted for four weeks, and a mixed approach (explicit and implicit) was used to teach critical thinking skills. The study concluded that the effectiveness of instructional design in developing critical thinking skills.

4- A study (Zarei, 2018) The study was conducted in Malaysia.

Students are unable to use their critical thinking skills in class activities.

Nowadays some teachers use the traditional method of teaching where students may not be given the opportunity to think critically. In this way. If critical thinking starts in schools, it will create citizens who are more creative and able to use their skills effectively. Subsequently, this study investigates the use of critical thinking in language learning and how it enhances English among learners of English as a second language. The qualitative method was used and data were collected using the semi-structured interview. The sample included 30 postgraduate students in Selangor in order to gain insight into enhancing students' critical thinking in learning English. Data were analyzed qualitatively using content analysis. The results of the study revealed that the students were able to learn better using critical thinking that enhanced their English language skills. In conclusion, the results indicated that the students were able to engage in reflective and independent thinking to solve problems in learning using critical thinking.

Research procedures:

The study relied on the experimental design with partial control with two equal groups, the first (experimental), which was studied according to the story method, and the second with the random control group, which was studied according to the traditional method with a post-test to measure critical thinking appropriate for the current study, as shown in the following table (1)

Table(1)

| The group | Parity | Independent variable | Dependent variable |
|--------------|---|----------------------|---------------------------------------|
| Experimental | 1- Chronological age (in months) 2- Parents' academic achievement | Story method | 1- Postgraduate achievement test. |
| Control | 3- intelligence 4- Previous information 5- Before critical thinking | Normal method | 2- Dimensional critical thinking test |

Community and sample research:

The research community was identified with students of the second grade intermediate and secondary schools in Anbar Governorate for the academic year 2018-2019.

A sample of the study population was chosen randomly, and it was (IbnZaydoun Intermediate School for Boys) as a sample, and the number of second-grade students is an average of (64) students. With two divisions to be a field for applying his experiment in it, the sample was distributed equally between two experimental groups who studied by the story method and a

control group who studied using the normal method. The school administration expressed its willingness to facilitate the task of conducting and implementing the study, and statistical equivalence was conducted between the two groups before starting the experiment in some variables, namely: the chronological age of the students calculated in months, the previous information, a test of 20 items, a type of multiple choice, and the intelligence test using the Raven test for matrices. This test consists of (60) items divided into five groups of difficulty, a before critical thinking test, and the parents' academic achievement. Table (2) shows this

Table(2)

The T-value, mean, and variance of the two groups in the equivalence variables

| The group | Experimental (32) students | | Control (32) students | | T-value at (0.05) | | Statistical significance |
|-----------|----------------------------|----------|-----------------------|----------|-------------------|---------|--------------------------|
| Variables | the middle | variance | the middle | variance | Calculate d | Tabular | Not significant at the |
| | | | | | | | |

| | | | | | | | |
|------------------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|-------------------|
| Cognitive flexibility | 10.14 | 3.76 | 10.75 | 3.44 | 0.892 | 2.00 at a degree of freedom of 62 | 0.05 level |
| Chronological age | 170.25 | 100.56 | 171.84 | 94.46 | 0.536 | | |
| Previous knowledge | 8.56 | 5.19 | 9.72 | 6.45 | 1.673 | | |
| IQ score | 32.03 | 8.42 | 32.59 | 10.92 | 0.487 | | |

From the observation of Table (2), it appears that the calculated values of the four variables are less than the tabular value (2.00) at the level (0.05) and the degree of freedom (62), meaning that the experimental and control groups are equivalent in these variables.

As for the equivalence of the parents' achievement, the chi-square was used. The results showed that the calculated value of (X^2) is equal to (0.610) for fathers and (0.765) for mothers, which is less than the tabular value of the chi-square (7.82) at the significance level (0.05) and with a degree of freedom (3), which indicates that The two study groups are equivalent in the academic achievement of the parents.

Study requirements:

1- Formulating behavioral goals:For the purpose of building the achievement test and preparing teaching plans, (120) behavioral goals were formulated according to (Bloom) classification of the cognitive domain for the lower levels, with (60) goals for knowledge, (45) goals for understanding, and (15) goals. After they were presented to a group of arbitrators and specialists, modifications

were made. It was confirmed that the wording was sound and appropriate to the level for which it was developed.

- 2- Determining the scientific material (content):** The researcher identified the scientific material that will be taught during the experiment for the third, fourth and fifth chapters of the social studies curriculum to be taught by the Ministry of Education.
- 3- Preparing teaching plans:**A set of daily teaching plans have been prepared to achieve the objectives of the study in the light of the behavioral objectives of the subjects of the scientific subject specified during the duration of the experiment for both groups. The experimental group according to the story and the control group according to the traditional method. The researcher presented a model of these plans by a group of specialists and experts, to express their opinions and observations, and in light of this, some modifications were made and it became ready for implementation.
- 4- Establishment of the achievement test:** The specification table was prepared in the light of the scientific material and

behavioral objectives according to the following table (3):

Table (3) Specification Table

| Chapter s | numbe r of pages | Weight percentil e | Levels | | | Number of paragraph s |
|---------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|
| | | | knowledg e 50% | Understandin g 37.5% | Applicatio n 12.5% | |
| Third | 18 | 37.5% | 8 | 6 | 2 | 16 |
| Fourth | 10 | 20.83% | 4 | 3 | 1 | 8 |
| Fifth | 20 | 41.67% | 8 | 6 | 2 | 16 |
| Total | 48 | 100% | 20 | 15 | 5 | 40 |

A multiple-choice objective test was prepared consisting of (40) items, each item containing (4) alternatives, and for the purpose of knowing the item's difficulty level, ease, strength of discrimination, effectiveness of wrong alternatives and stability coefficient. The test was applied to a pilot sample consisting of (100) students from Second-grade average students were randomly selected, and after the researcher made sure that they studied the material included in the experiment, and to facilitate the procedures statistically, the researcher arranged the paragraphs in descending order from the highest degree to the lowest degree, then chose the upper and lower extreme samples with a percentage of 27% as the best two extreme groups to represent the whole sample and then treated it statistically.

Critical thinking test preparation.

The study requires a critical thinking test for second-grade intermediate students, after setting the goal, reviewing previous studies and literature, and determining critical thinking skills (conclusion, assumptions or postulates, deduction, interpretation, and evaluation of arguments). A test consisting of 20 situations divided into (5) skills was prepared, and each situation consisted of three answers. The test was presented to a group of specialists in history, teaching methods, measurement and evaluation to express their opinions and observations on the test and the validity of formulating its paragraphs, modifying them, or deleting what they saw as inappropriate. It was taken to accept the paragraph that has an approval rate (80% or more), so all the paragraphs were accepted, and thus the validity of the apparent test was verified.

Logical honesty was verified by developing a definition of critical thinking and its skills, which covered these skills in a balanced manner. In order to know the time required for answering the test, the clarity of the test objective, the instructions, the answer and the test paragraphs, and in order to verify the validity of the test construction, the test was applied to a sample of (30) students other than the original study sample, and the time for all students to complete an answer was determined, and the average time was (40) minutes and the paragraphs were clear.

In order to find the validity of the construction of the test, a correlation relationship was found between the score of each test situation and the total test score by calculating the scores of the female students of the exploratory sample consisting of (20) students. After applying the T-Test of the correlation coefficients, it was found that the calculated T-values for each position are greater than the tabular value of (2.05) with the degree of freedom (18), and at the level of significance (0.05), That is, the test items

are consistent with the overall test score, and the test is at a high level of consistency.

After the survey sample answers were corrected, then the scores were arranged in descending order; The sample was divided into two parts, a high group of (15) students, and a low group of (15) students, as the literature on the subject indicates that it is better to divide the same scores into (50%) high and (50%) low, especially in the classroom tests. (Kelly) found that this ratio gives the highest discrimination to the paragraph if the distribution is equal (Al-Zuhairi, 2017: 211).

The stability of the test was verified by the re-test method. Accordingly, the test was re-tested on the same exploratory sample (30) students, and after two weeks of the first application, the test was repeated for them again and the Pearson correlation coefficient was used between the scores of the two applications, and it was found that the reliability coefficient reached (0.89). And he used the appropriate statistical methods and using the program (Excel 2020)

Research results:

Presentation of the results of the first hypothesis related to the achievement.

Table (4) The differences in the answers of the experimental group and the control group in the achievement test.

| The group | The number | Arithmetic average | Variance | Degree of freedom | T-Test | | Statistical significance |
|--------------|------------|--------------------|----------|-------------------|------------|---------|--------------------------|
| | | | | | Calculated | Tabular | |
| Experimental | 32 | 28.82 | 16.24 | 62 | Calculated | Tabular | Significant 0.05 |

| | | | | | | | |
|----------------|-----------|--------------|--------------|--|--------------|-------------|--|
| Control | 32 | 22.12 | 24.16 | | 6.023 | 2.00 | |
|----------------|-----------|--------------|--------------|--|--------------|-------------|--|

Table (4) shows that the tabular value (6.023) is greater than the calculated value (2.00) at the level (0.05) and the degree of freedom (62) that is, there are statistically significant differences at the level (0.05) between the average scores of the experimental group in the achievement test that is taught by the story method. and the mean scores of the control group that is taught using the traditional method and in favor of the experimental group.

Presentation of the results of the first hypothesis of critical thinking.

Table (5) The differences in the answers of the study sample in the critical thinking test (before and after) for the experimental group

| Critic test | The number | Arithmetic average | Variance | Degree of freedom | T-Test | | Statistical significance |
|---------------|------------|--------------------|-------------|-------------------|--------------|-------------|--------------------------|
| | | | | | Calculated | Tabular | |
| Before | 32 | 10.14 | 3.76 | 62 | 6.045 | 2.00 | Significant 0.05 |
| After | 32 | 14.82 | 4.78 | | | | |

Table (4) shows that the tabular value (6.045) is greater than the calculated value (2.00) at the level (0.05) and the degree of freedom (62) that is, there are statistically significant differences at the level (0.05) between the variance of previous results, the superiority of the experimental group over the control group in the test Achievement and Critical Thinking This may be attributed to: The use of the story helps to develop the imagination of students, and imagination is an important basis for the thinking that Piaget refers to as beginning to appear in the abstract procedural stage in adolescence. Without the development of imagination, children cannot reach the abstract stage that requires realizing causality through thinking to analyze the relationships between variables and thus increasing achievement.

Sources and References:

- 1- Jayyousi, Majdi Rashid, and Al-Jamal, SuhaFathi, (2019), The effect of using the story method in developing academic achievement in technology for seventh grade students in Tulkarm Governorate, Journal of Educational and Psychological Sciences, University of Bahrain, Volume (20), Issue (2) , July, pp. 102-134.
- 2- Quraan, Muhammad Eid, and Al-DulaimiTaha (2017 AD) The effect of a thinking-based teaching program on improving the skills of employing classroom questions among teachers of the Arabic language, research published in a magazine, Al-Quds Open University for Research and Educational Studies. Volume 26, issue (20) Jordan.
- 3- Al-Zuhairi, Haider Abdul Karim (2017), Educational Research Methods, Amman,

- Debono Center for Teaching Thinking for publication.
- 4- Alwan, Inside Muhammad, 2016, The Unit Method in Teaching Social Studies (An Analytical Study), AhilAl-Bayt Journal, Peace be upon them, No. 19, pp. 527-552.
 - 5- Al-Sharideh, Muhammad Khalifa, and Bishara, MowaffaqSalim, (2010), Complex thinking and its relationship to some variables, Damascus University Journal - Volume (26), Issue (3).
 - 6- Hamdan, Ribhi Khalil Ahmed, (2018), The effect of the storyboard on raising achievement in Arabic language among second-grade students in Irbid Kasbah Directorate, the International Specialized Educational Journal, Volume (7), Issue (7).
 - 7- Al-Mudhaffar, LuqmanWahhab, (2017), The Role of the Short Story in Teaching Art Education and its Impact on the Achievement of First Intermediate Grade Students, Journal of the College of Education for Girls for Human Sciences, Issue: 21, eleventh year.
 - 8- Al-Hashimi, Abdul-Rahman and others, (2014) Children's literature and culture, Dar Al-Thaqafa for Publishing and Distribution, Amman, Jordan.
 - 9- Khammas, NaghamFalah, (2018), The Effectiveness of Using Differential Education in Acquiring History for Fifth Literary Grade Students, Journal of the College of Basic Education for Educational and Human Sciences, Babylon, Issue (37), February.
 - 10- Hamid, Salma Majid, and Muhammad, Muhammad Adnan (2019), Thinking skills between theory and practice, historical thinking as a model, Baghdad, Iraq: Dar Amjad Publishing.
 - 11- Muhammad, Ahmed Hashem, and Jihad, NouraKhaled (2016), the effect of the numbered heads strategy in the achievement of second-grade intermediate students in history, University of Baghdad, Journal of Educational and Psychological Research, Issue (54), Baghdad, Iraq.
 - 12- Ali, Abdel-Zahir Ali, (2017), The Instructed Story: The Art of Teaching by Story, Edition 1, Dar Alem Al Thaqafa for Printing and Publishing, Cairo, Egypt.
 - 13- Younis, Iman, and Jassem, Saadi (2017), Critical Thinking of Kindergarten Child, Academic Book Center, Amman, Jordan.
 - 14- Kruse, W. (2010). Historical short stories in the Post-secondary biology classroom. Iowa State University.
 - 15- Zarei, Nafiseh,(2018) , The Impact of critical thinking on Learning English Language, Asian Journal of Social Science Research Volume 1, Issue 2.
 - 16- Mahmood, Shumaila,(2017) Testing the effectiveness of a critical thinking skills intervention for initial teacher education students in Pakistan, the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Education, University of Southampton.